

## LAW &amp; SOCIAL POLICY | RESEARCH ARTICLE

# Effectiveness of Regional Regulation Implementation in Guidance and Protection of Street Vendors in Manokwari Regency: A Study of Policy Analysis and Socio-Economic Impacts

Paskalina Setitit<sup>1</sup>, Roberth KR Hammar<sup>2</sup>, Carina Budi Siswani<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1,2,3</sup> Department of Science Law, Faculty of Law, Universitas Caritas Indonesia, Papua, Indonesia.

Email: [paschalinssetitit@gmail.com](mailto:paschalinssetitit@gmail.com), [roberthhammar168@gmail.com](mailto:roberthhammar168@gmail.com), [carinabudi@gmail.com](mailto:carinabudi@gmail.com)

## ARTICLE HISTORY

Received: July 12, 2025

Revised: August 25, 2025

Accepted: September 02, 2025

## DOI

<https://doi.org/10.52970/grlspr.v5i1.1565>

## ABSTRACT

This study aims to assess the effectiveness of the implementation of Manokwari Regency Regional Regulation Number 15 of 2021 concerning the Arrangement and Empowerment of Street Vendors (PKL) and its socio-economic impact on these micro-enterprises. As the capital of West Papua Province, Manokwari Regency is experiencing rapid population growth and urbanization, which impacts the dynamics of urban space and increases street vendor activity in strategic public spaces. This regional regulation is expected to be an instrument that not only regulates street vendors' physical and legal existence but also empowers them to transform into independent and competitive formal business actors. However, this study found that implementing the Regional Regulation still faces significant obstacles, such as low legal awareness and understanding among street vendors, suboptimal coordination between government agencies, and locations for street vendor relocations that are considered less strategic and impact the sustainability of their businesses. This creates a gap between written legal norms (law on the books) and actual practice (law in action), resulting in less than optimal guidance and protection for street vendors. The socio-economic impacts of implementing the Regional Regulation are also diverse. On the one hand, street vendors (PKL) significantly support the informal economy and reduce unemployment in Manokwari Regency. On the other hand, the less participatory arrangement and the dominance of a repressive approach create uncertainty and resistance among street vendors, which impacts their income stability and engagement in development programs. This study emphasizes the importance of a more integrated, participatory, educational, and empowering approach and increased synergy between agencies to ensure inclusive and sustainable policy implementation. The research methodology employed a qualitative approach, collecting data through semi-structured interviews, participant observation, and official document analysis. Data analysis used manual reduction and coding techniques to identify key themes. Validity and reliability were maintained through data triangulation and member checking. The results of this study are expected to provide strategic policy recommendations for the development and protection of street vendors (PKL), which can harmonize urban development needs with the welfare of micro-communities, particularly in autonomous regions with unique socio-cultural characteristics such as West Papua.

**Keywords:** Street Vendors, Legal Protection, Regional Regulations, Policy Effectiveness, Socio-Economic Impact, Manokwari Regency.



## I. Introduction

The Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia, as stated in the Preamble to the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia (Soekarno, 1945), has a fundamental objective to protect the entire nation and all of Indonesia's homeland, advance public welfare, educate the nation's life, and participate in implementing world order based on independence, eternal peace, and social justice. These constitutional objectives are reflected in various aspects of governance, including the regulation of regional government authority, which is oriented towards providing public services that are closer, responsive, and participatory to the community's needs (Rasyid, 2000). Through Article 18 of the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia and translated into Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, Indonesia implements a decentralized system that provides autonomy to regions to regulate and manage their own government affairs according to their respective regions, including in terms of economic management and spatial planning (Djohan, 2016).

Manokwari Regency, the capital of West Papua Province, is a region with unique socio-economic, cultural, and geographical characteristics in eastern Indonesia (BPS West Papua, 2024). Manokwari has experienced rapid population growth and urbanization in the past two decades as the center of government and regional economic activity. While driving dynamic infrastructure development and increasing formal economic activity, this growth also presents real challenges in managing public spaces and regulating informal economic activity. Data from the Central Statistics Agency (BPS) of West Papua Province indicates that as of 2024, Manokwari's population will reach approximately 204,000, with the majority residing in urban areas, utilizing public spaces as a means of economic survival (Manokwari: BPS, 2024). One of the most striking urban phenomena in Manokwari is the presence of street vendors (PKL), who utilize various strategic locations in the city—such as sidewalks, primary roadsides, around traditional markets, and even public recreation areas—as their primary arenas for economic activity (Tadjoeddin, 2013). Street vendors in Manokwari are significant contributors to the informal economy and play a crucial role in meeting the needs of the wider community, particularly those with low incomes. Street vendors also reflect economic and social migration patterns from local indigenous communities and immigrants, who seek alternative opportunities outside the formal economic structure, which is often challenging to access equally (Alrasyid, 2020).

The dependence of many families on income from street vendors illustrates the close relationship between this informal sector and the dynamics of urban poverty. As Tadjoeddin (2013) notes, street vendors are an integral part of the urban economy, serving as a socio-economic support, absorbing labor, and encouraging money circulation among lower-income communities. However, street vendor activities in poorly organized and managed public spaces can lead to various social and environmental problems, such as traffic congestion, public order disruption, public space functions violations, and visual pollution that diminishes the city's well-being. This issue presents a complex policy dilemma for local governments: maintaining the sustainability of the informal economy while simultaneously managing the city to be orderly, safe, and aesthetically pleasing for all residents (Alrasyid, 2020). In response to these challenges, the Manokwari Regency Government took a strategic step by issuing Manokwari Regency Regional Regulation (Perda) Number 15 of 2021 concerning the Arrangement and Empowerment of Street Vendors (Dinas Perindagkop, 2023). This regulation not only serves as a legal instrument governing the spatial planning and activities of street vendors in Manokwari City but also encourages the economic transformation of street vendors from informal economic activities that are often temporary and lack legal certainty to independent and competitive micro-enterprises (Dinas Perindagkop, 2023). Behind this regulation lies the government's high hope of creating an orderly, comfortable city to live in, and providing certainty of business locations for street vendors, namely by providing land or premises per the zoning stipulated in the regional spatial plan.

The implementation of this Regional Regulation is carried out through the synergy of various technical agencies, such as the Department of Industry, Trade, Cooperatives, and SMEs (Disperindagkop), the Public Order Agency (Satpol PP), the Department of Transportation, and the Department of the Environment (Manokwari Transportation Agency, 2024). The approach taken is programmatic, including physical business location planning, entrepreneurship and business management training for street vendors, the provision of

business facilities (e.g., carts and tents), and enforcement efforts involving outreach and dialogue. These efforts also aim to strengthen local economic empowerment by increasing business capacity and legality, so street vendors are no longer trapped in uncertainty and negative social stigma (Tadjoeddin, 2013; Dinas Perindagkop, 2023).

However, the reality on the ground shows that the effective implementation of this Regional Regulation still faces several substantial challenges. Many street vendors do not fully understand the content and intent of the Regional Regulation, so their activities often fall outside the provisions, such as trading on sidewalks or prohibited roads (Dinas Perindagkop, 2023). This low legal awareness raises the risk of conflict with law enforcement officers and creates business uncertainty for vendors (Djohan, 2016). Furthermore, resistance to relocation is a classic problem; many street vendors refuse to be relocated to new locations because they consider the new locations non-strategic, directly impacting their turnover and business sustainability. Differences in competitiveness and access to capital between local and non-local vendors also contribute to unequal distribution of development benefits (Tadjoeddin, 2013).

Another obstacle is limited resources and inter-agency coordination in implementing integrated and sustainable development programs. Some training and business mentoring programs have not yet reached the entire street vendor population, and enforcement efforts are sometimes repressive without being supported by an educational approach capable of building voluntary understanding and compliance with the law (Djohan, 2016; Department of Industry, Trade, and Cooperatives, 2023). This reflects the gap between legal norms (law on the books) written in regulations, and their actual application (law in action) in society (Friedman, 1975). Based on this complex picture, this study aims to comprehensively evaluate the effectiveness of Regional Regulation No. 15 of 2021 in fostering and protecting street vendors (PKL) in Manokwari Regency. The approach combines policy analysis from a normative legal perspective, technical implementation in the field, and the social and economic impacts of street vendors and the wider community. This research is expected to not only identify obstacles and supporting factors in the implementation of the Regional Regulation but also formulate strategic policy recommendations that can strengthen the role of local governments in managing the informal economy in an inclusive, sustainable, and humane manner (Soekanto, 2004).

Broadly speaking, protecting and fostering street vendors is not merely a matter of enforcing regulations, but rather part of the state's noble duty to ensure the social welfare of its citizens (Law No. 11 of 2009 concerning Social Welfare). Effective policies must create a safe, fair, and productive business ecosystem for micro-entrepreneurs, especially those in the informal sector who have often been marginalized. In this way, street vendors in Manokwari Regency can transform into a competitive driving force for the local creative economy while maintaining the sustainability of a representative and equitable urban spatial plan (Wuradji & Djohani, 2018). The urgency of this research arises from the complexity and challenges faced in implementing Regional Regulation Number 15 of 2021 concerning the Management and Empowerment of Street Vendors in Manokwari Regency. On the one hand, street vendors are a crucial economic group for meeting the needs of low-income communities. They are a pillar of the micro-economy that must be protected and empowered. On the other hand, the irregular and suboptimal management of street vendors negatively impacts urban order, the function of public spaces, and the quality of the urban environment. The imbalance between the need for socio-economic protection and the management of public spaces demands strategic and evaluative measures so that regional policies can address real problems with inclusive, sustainable, and equitable solutions. Furthermore, this research is crucial for policy reform and improvements to implementation mechanisms that can strengthen synergy between the government, street vendors, and the community.

This study aims to comprehensively assess the effectiveness of Regional Regulation No. 15 of 2021 in fostering and protecting street vendors in Manokwari Regency. The study focuses on analyzing the legal substance of the regulation, the level of understanding and acceptance of street vendors, technical implementation by relevant officials, and the socio-economic impact of the policy on the lives of street vendors and urban planning. Using a multidimensional approach, the research findings are expected to provide strategic and applicable policy recommendations to improve the effectiveness of street vendor

development, strengthen social inclusion, and support orderly and competitive urban development. More broadly, this study is also expected to provide a scientific and practical contribution to developing informal economic management in autonomous regions, particularly in areas with unique socio-economic and cultural dynamics such as West Papua.

## II. Literature Review and Hypothesis Development

Street vendors (PKL) are micro-entrepreneurs who play a vital role in the informal economy, particularly in developing cities like Manokwari Regency. (Zaenul et al., 2024) The wholesale and retail trade sector, which includes street vendor activities, contributes significantly to Manokwari Regency's Gross Regional Domestic Product (GRDP) and employs the community, particularly in the informal sector. Street vendors in Manokwari generally choose strategic locations, such as the busy and easily accessible Wosi sub-district, making it a potential area for increasing vendor income. According to Yenni (2020), street vendor development through location planning and empowerment in cities in West Papua still faces obstacles related to the increasing number of street vendors and the limited space available for their activities. The regulatory approach carried out by the Public Order Agency (Satpol PP) generally focuses on relocating and eliminating street vendor locations while still paying attention to social, economic, and environmental health aspects. However, its effectiveness is often hampered by resistance from street vendors and a lack of community participation in the development process.

Economic inequality and access to commodities also hinder the empowerment of street vendors, particularly local groups such as Papuan women. (Fenetiruma et al., 2022) revealed a significant disparity between local and non-local vendors in traditional markets in West Papua, resulting in low competitiveness due to limited capital, technology, and access to distribution networks. This study concludes that more inclusive and adaptive policies based on local needs are needed to ensure effective and equitable street vendor empowerment. Furthermore, research by Resubun (2017) confirms that traditional markets in Manokwari are not only economic centers but also reflect the indigenous community's social and cultural interactions, so street vendor development must consider cultural and social aspects to create sustainable, inclusive, and equitable businesses. (Robbins, 1994) The theory of effectiveness emphasizes that the success of a development program depends on the extent to which the normative objectives of the policy are realized in actual behavior in the field, which requires good coordination between implementing agencies and the active involvement of the target community. The lack of coordination and legal understanding among street vendors is a real obstacle that causes low levels of compliance and development effectiveness in many regions, including West Papua (Soekanto, 2004; Friedman, 1975). Regulating street vendors without adequate empowerment and facilitation often leads to social and economic problems, such as decreased income for street vendors and social conflict. Therefore, Wuradji and Djohani (2018) emphasize the importance of an educational and empowering legal approach, so street vendors are seen not only as objects of regulation but also as subjects of sustainable microeconomic development.

Furthermore, although various studies have addressed the economic, social, and policy aspects related to street vendors (PKL), significant gaps remain that need to be addressed, particularly in the context of Manokwari Regency. Existing studies generally focus on one aspect, such as microeconomics, social empowerment, or structuring policies, but rarely integrate these three dimensions comprehensively and in-depth. This gap is reflected in the limited research combining normative legal analysis with technical implementation in the field and simultaneous socio-economic impacts. Furthermore, internal factors such as poor legal understanding and the lack of active participation of street vendors in the development process are rarely studied alongside external factors such as weak inter-agency coordination and inappropriate relocation locations, which directly impact the sustainability of street vendor businesses. These shortcomings indicate that the effectiveness of the implementation of Regional Regulation No. 15 of 2021 still requires a comprehensive evaluation using a more adaptive, multidimensional approach tailored to Manokwari's socio-cultural characteristics and local economic conditions.

Based on this gap, this study proposes the primary hypothesis that the implementation of the Regional Regulation has not been optimally effective. This is due to low legal awareness and understanding among street vendors, minimal involvement as subjects in decision-making, and limited coordination between government institutions involved in development. Furthermore, the less-than-strategic location of street vendor relocations is also a significant obstacle to the sustainability of their businesses. The supporting hypothesis states that the effectiveness of street vendor development can be significantly improved if a more participatory and educational program approach is implemented, in which street vendors are actively involved from the planning stage through implementation. Strengthening inter-agency coordination and providing adequate supporting facilities and infrastructure are also crucial for creating a sustainable and inclusive micro-enterprise ecosystem while considering the local socio-economic and cultural context. Therefore, this study is expected to provide policy recommendations that are not only administrative but also applicable and oriented towards equitable empowerment.

### III. Research Method

This research methodology uses a qualitative approach to understand in-depth the implementation of Regional Regulation Number 15 of 2021 concerning the Arrangement and Empowerment of Street Vendors (PKL) in Manokwari Regency. Qualitative research was chosen because it can explore and interpret data in the form of words and narratives from relevant actors and stakeholders, thus producing a comprehensive picture of social dynamics, policies, and impacts on the ground (Creswell, 2016; Walidin, Saifullah & Tabrani, 2015). The sampling strategy in this study used purposive sampling, which intentionally selects informants based on specific criteria relevant to the research focus. The key informants consisted of street vendors spread across several strategic locations in Manokwari, officers from the Public Order Agency (Satpol PP), officials from the Department of Industry, Trade, Cooperatives, and SMEs, and community leaders familiar with the socio-economic context of street vendors. This approach allowed researchers to explore the informants' perceptions, experiences, and understandings in depth (Zaenul et al., 2024; Walidin, Saifullah & Tabrani, 2015).

Qualitative data collection was conducted through semi-structured interviews, which provided flexibility in eliciting open-ended responses from informants while focusing on key points consistent with the research problem. Face-to-face interviews with vendors and relevant officials were conducted to obtain authentic and contextual primary data. Furthermore, participant observation was conducted to directly observe street vendor activities and policy implementation in the field. Documentation in the form of policy documents, reports, and related archives served as secondary data sources that complemented the analysis (Fadli, 2021; Florensa, 2020). Data analysis followed qualitative descriptive stages, using a data reduction model, data presentation, and inductive conclusion drawing. Data reduction was done by sorting relevant information, filtering it, and organizing it to facilitate interpretation. Data presentation included descriptive narratives, tables, and direct quotes from informants. Conclusions linked field findings to theories and conceptual frameworks of policy effectiveness, law enforcement, and community empowerment (Florensa, 2020; Salman, 2020).

The data coding method was performed manually using open coding techniques, identifying themes and categories from interview transcripts and field data, which were then grouped into broad themes relevant to the research objectives. This coding helped ensure data systematization, allowing for focused and in-depth analysis. This approach also supports internal validity by allowing for repeated reflection on the data (Salman, 2020; Creswell, 2016). This study employed several techniques to ensure the validity and reliability of the qualitative analysis. Validity was confirmed through triangulation of data sources, comparing the results of interviews, observations, and official documents to obtain a consistent and comprehensive picture. Furthermore, member checking techniques allowed informants to confirm or revise their interview results. Reliability was strengthened by documenting the data collection and analysis process in detail so that other researchers or readers could review it as an audit trail, as well as by consistently using interview and coding procedures throughout the study (Creswell, 2016; Lincoln & Guba, 1985 in Florensa, 2020). With these

approaches and procedures, this study seeks to explore the substantive aspects of the effectiveness of implementing Regional Regulations and the development of street vendors (PKL) holistically, producing valid and accountable findings from an in-depth qualitative perspective.

## IV. Results and Discussion

### 4.1. Forms of Legal Protection for Street Vendors (PKL)

Descriptive-Qualitative Analysis Based on Regulations and Theories Legal protection for Street Vendors (PKL) in Manokwari Regency is normatively stated in Regional Regulation 15 of 2021. This regulation states that the forms of protection provided to PKL include:

1. Determination of a business location that is legally valid and in accordance with the city area zoning;
2. Empowerment programs through training, provision of business infrastructure, and easy access to capital;
3. Non-repressive enforcement mechanisms, such as written warnings, participatory dialogue, and relocation based on mutual agreement.

This regulation derives legitimacy from various national legal norms, including:

1. Article 18, paragraph (6) of the 1945 Constitution, which confirms the right of regions to establish regional regulations within the framework of autonomy;
2. Law No. 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, which emphasizes that public services and local economic empowerment are the basic functions of regional government;
3. Law No. 20 of 2008 concerning MSMEs, which recognizes the existence of micro-business actors, including street vendors, and guarantees protection and guidance for them;
4. PP No. 16 of 2018 concerning the Civil Service Police Unit, which directs the approach to enforcing Regional Regulations to uphold the values of humanity and social justice.

Theoretically, the effectiveness of legal protection for street vendors can be analyzed from several perspectives. The Theory of Legal Effectiveness emphasizes the importance of alignment between the substance of the law and the reality of its implementation. Based on interviews with 15 street vendors spread across Jalan Yos Sudarso, Jalan Merdeka, and around Sanggeng Market, it was found that most vendors did not fully understand the contents of Regional Regulation Number 15 of 2021. They generally only knew that selling on sidewalks or roads was prohibited, but were unaware of available alternatives or legal procedures. One vendor stated, "We do not have a permanent location; we just go with the flow. Sometimes we get evicted, sometimes we let them be. However, no one told us about the official location or the established procedures."

This phenomenon demonstrates a gap between norms and their implementation, reflecting a failure in the legal impact aspect, as explained by Lawrence M. Friedman. Although legal substance is available, its reach is limited due to a lack of dissemination and legal education for those who should be protected. Soerjono Soekanto's Law Enforcement Theory emphasizes that law enforcement requires a fusion of norms, values, and social facts. In interviews with five members of the Public Order Agency (Satpol PP), they stated that regional regulations are indeed the basis for enforcement operations. However, their implementation often faces a dilemma between order and humanity. Officers acknowledged that dialogical and educational approaches are still limited, and some enforcement operations are carried out suddenly without prior outreach. This demonstrates a weak legal culture—where the law is not widely accepted or understood by the target community.

The Social Welfare Theory, as reflected in Law No. 11 of 2009, states that the state has an obligation to guarantee the fundamental rights of its citizens, including in the economic sector. Protection for street vendors should not only prevent eviction but also provide guaranteed access to social and economic services. However, interviews with officials from the Department of Industry, Trade, Cooperatives, and Transportation revealed that empowerment efforts such as business training, cart distribution, and licensing facilitation have been implemented, but have not yet reached all street vendors due to budget constraints and inter-agency coordination. From a Sustainable Economy perspective, street vendors are integral to the local economic system. Regulation without protection can actually create instability in the informal economy. Therefore, regulations must consider the sustainability of street vendors' income as part of the principle of social justice.

Furthermore, Wuradji and Djohani's Community Empowerment Theory suggests that the law should be used as a tool of empowerment—not oppression. In this regard, regional regulations need to be translated into concrete actions that reduce power imbalances, such as regular training, cooperative partnerships, and assistance with business legality. Finally, entrepreneurship theory shows that street vendors have the potential to be transformed into productive entrepreneurs if policies are supported to create a conducive business environment. Regional regulations that not only limit but also clearly facilitate can transform street vendors' position from the informal sector to part of a sustainable creative economy. Legal protection for street vendors in Manokwari Regency has traditionally encompassed legal aspects of location, empowerment, and a humane approach to enforcement. However, implementation in the field still faces various obstacles. Poor legal understanding among street vendors, limited government outreach, and a repressive approach to enforcement indicate the ineffectiveness of comprehensive legal protection. Synergy between legal, educational, participatory, and economic approaches is needed within a more inclusive policy framework. Ideal legal protection ensures compliance with regulations and creates a fair and sustainable business ecosystem for street vendors, as citizens are entitled to a decent living.

#### 4.2. Identification of Obstacles to the Implementation of Regional Regulations in the Development of Street Vendors (PKL)

##### 1. Implementation Analysis Based on Theory and Regulations

Articles 7 through 11 of Manokwari Regency Regulation Number 15 of 2021 establish the main components of efforts to develop street vendors (PKL). These steps include:

- a. Data collection and classification of street vendors based on business type;
- b. Provision of business locations in accordance with spatial planning;
- c. Skills and entrepreneurship training;
- d. Provision of supporting facilities such as carts, tents, and business capital.

Legally, this policy aligns with the mandate of Law Number 20 of 2008 concerning MSMEs, which states that the government is obligated to provide guidance, empowerment, and facilitation to micro-entrepreneurs. However, in its implementation, research has found a gap between the policy's content and its implementation, particularly in three key areas:

- a. Minimal socialization and participation of street vendors in the coaching and decision-making process;
- b. Limited relocation facilities and locations provided by the government, both in terms of quantity and quality;
- c. The rejection of most street vendors towards relocation is mainly due to economic sustainability factors and the attractiveness of the new business location, which is considered non-strategic.

This was confirmed by interviews with 15 street vendors (PKL) across Manokwari, where the majority admitted to having never received any training, official data collection, or direct guidance from the government. One vendor on Jalan Merdeka stated, "We have heard about the regulation, but we do not know what it says. We were only warned to move, but no explanation of where we would be located." This statement illustrates that guidance remains instructive and less informative, creating a perception gap between state officials and the target community. Implementing guidance policies for street vendors requires a theoretical analysis to assess the extent to which the approach can meet legal and social objectives.

The Theory of Legal Effectiveness states that a regulation is effective if its normative objectives are realized in actual behavior. Although Regional Regulation No. 15 of 2021 details guidance steps, interviews revealed that outputs (short-term results) and outcomes (long-term results) have not been achieved. This indicates low effectiveness due to weak implementation processes. According to Soekanto and Friedman, law enforcement requires three components: legal structure, legal substance, and legal culture. Interviews with five members of the Public Order Agency (Satpol PP) confirmed that enforcement is carried out according to the stages stipulated by local regulations—from notification to action. However, they also acknowledged that limited human resources and budget mean that enforcement is carried out only occasionally and is less educational. This indicates a low legal culture, both on the part of the community and the government.

From a social welfare perspective, street vendor development should ensure the fulfillment of the fundamental economic rights of marginalized communities. However, if the development program is used solely to justify enforcement without ongoing support, it becomes more repressive than participatory. Interviews with three Department of Industry, Trade, Cooperatives, and Transportation officials revealed that training and assistance with facilities such as tents and carts have been provided. However, coverage is limited due to budget constraints and has not yet reached all street vendors. Fostering street vendors (PKL) within a sustainable economic framework should be a long-term strategy to create a resilient local economic system. However, interviews revealed that relocation facilities, such as the old terminal area, are unattractive to street vendors due to their lack of strategic transaction potential. This means that the microeconomic aspects of this policy have not been adequately considered and do not support the sustainability of street vendors' incomes.

Community Empowerment Theory emphasizes the importance of community involvement at every stage of policymaking. When top-down guidance does not involve street vendors in the planning process, it becomes less of an empowerment tool and more of a control mechanism. Most street vendors interviewed reported never being involved in meetings, consultation forums, or decision-making regarding relocation. From an entrepreneurial theory perspective, coaching should be a pathway for street vendors to become competent and independent entrepreneurs. However, interviews revealed that the training and facilitation did not cover financial management, product innovation, or marketing. Some programs were conducted only once a year and were not sustainable, making it difficult to instill change in business behavior.

## 2. Key Findings and Need for Reform

Based on the integration of legal documents, theory, and field interview results, several main findings can be concluded:

- a. The implementation of the Regional Regulation has not substantially touched on the empowerment dimension;
- b. There is a gap between regulations and technical implementation in the field;
- c. Inter-agency coordination is still weak, particularly in terms of data collection, supervision, and facilitation;
- d. PKL has not been involved as a subject in the coaching process, thus reducing the program's effectiveness.

To answer these challenges and make legal protection for street vendors a tool of social justice, policy reform is needed in the form of:

- a. Increasing the capacity of institutions such as the Public Order Agency (Satpol PP), the Department of Industry, Trade, and Cooperatives, and the Department of Transportation, both in terms of human resources, budget, and cross-sector coordination mechanisms;
- b. Revitalization of the coaching approach by strengthening participatory methods—involving PKL from the planning stage;
- c. Integration of PKL development into the regional MSME development roadmap, including strengthening the micro-business ecosystem through market access, technology, and sustainable business training.

With these steps, it is hoped that the implementation of regional regulations will not only be administrative and repressive but will also be instrumental in building social inclusion, economic justice, and empowering poor urban communities, such as street vendors.

#### 4.3. Factors that influence the effectiveness of PKL development

##### 1. Supporting Factors for PKL Development

- a. **Regulatory Factors: High Normative Influence, Low Operational Influence**  
Manokwari Regency Regulation No. 15 of 2021 is the primary legal framework for street vendor development. Normatively, this regulation is highly adequate, covering aspects of business location, empowerment, and legal protection. However, field findings indicate that the level of understanding and internalization of the regulation among street vendors is very low. Few vendors know the regulation, and even fewer understand its contents. This indicates that the regulation is ineffective as a development tool because it is not accompanied by widespread legal education and outreach. According to law enforcement theory (Soekanto and Friedman), the law will be effective if it is not only available (legal substance), but also understood (legal culture) and consistently enforced (legal structure) (Soerjono Soekanto, 2004). Regulations have a high structural influence, but have less impact if they are not operationalized through public education and participation.
- b. **Availability of Technical Institutions: Great Potential, But Weak Coordination**  
Manokwari Regency has a well-equipped technical agency to implement this regulation, namely the Department of Industry, Trade, Cooperatives, and SMEs, the Public Order Agency (Satpol PP), the Department of Transportation, the Environment Agency (DLH), and the Department of Public Works. Each agency has specific responsibilities in guiding and managing street vendors, from site planning to training and providing business facilities. However, interviews revealed that inter-agency coordination is suboptimal. For example, relocations by the Public Order Agency (Satpol PP) often do not involve other technical agencies, depriving traders of adequate economic solutions. The absence of a permanent coordination forum, the lack of a cross-sector evaluation system, and budget constraints mean these agencies operate in silos. According to organizational effectiveness theory, synergy between actors and the existence of a functional coordinating system are crucial to the success of policy implementation. Technical institutions significantly influence the effectiveness of development, but only if they can carry out their coordination functions synergistically and sustainably.
- c. **Trader Commitment: Psychological and Economic Factors that Determine the Success of Coaching**  
Street vendors' commitment to development varies widely, depending on perceived benefits, involvement in the process, and assurance of economic sustainability. Some vendors expressed

readiness to participate in relocation and training, but most resisted due to feelings of exclusion or the new location not guaranteeing income. In community empowerment theory, participation and a sense of ownership are key to success. Commitment is not formed through threats or pressure, but rather through an approach that builds trust and allows residents to participate actively (Steers, R.M., 1977). From an entrepreneurial theory perspective, informal business owners like street vendors face high risks and are highly sensitive to changes in location and capital. Commitment will be low if the development approach fails to consider their economic realities (Zimmerer & Scarborough, 2005). Street vendors' commitment is crucial to the success of the development, and this will be enhanced if the approach is participatory, economic, and humanistic.

## 2. Inhibiting Factors:

### a. Low Level of Legal Understanding Among Street Vendors

The limited legal understanding among street vendors directly impacts their low awareness of their rights and obligations and their non-compliance with applicable legal provisions. Interviews revealed that most street vendors were unaware of the contents of Regional Regulation No. 15 of 2021 and only understood the prohibitions or threats of eviction, without understanding the protection or empowerment schemes it regulates. According to Soekanto, the effectiveness of law enforcement is determined by the community's legal culture—namely, the community's awareness and attitude toward the law.<sup>1</sup> This low level of understanding makes street vendors more reactive and resistant when enforcement is carried out, and they are less enthusiastic about participating in development programs. This significantly impacts the effectiveness of development, as it creates tension between policy implementers and recipients. Impact: High - Inhibits the active involvement of street vendors in the development process.

### b. Lack of Operational Budget

Budget constraints pose a systemic obstacle to comprehensive development. Several programs, such as training, capital assistance, facility procurement (carts, tents), and outreach programs, cannot reach all street vendors due to limited funding. In the context of policy effectiveness theory, program success is heavily influenced by resource support, both human and financial. Supervision and development are symbolic if the budget is minimal and lacks long-term impact. This directly impacts the program's reach and diminishes public trust. Impact: Medium-High - Limits the scale of development and slows the realization of the regulation's objectives.

### c. Weak Inter-Agency Coordination

The lack of an integrated system and weak communication between implementing agencies (Satpol PP, Disperindagkop, Dinas Perhubungan, DLH, and PU) led to discontinuity in program implementation. For example, relocations were carried out without synchronization with training or facilitation of business permits.

### d. Friedman's Legal System Theory

Theory emphasizes the importance of a solid and coordinated legal structure for effective policy implementation.<sup>3</sup> When institutions operate independently, output becomes partial, and guidance loses effectiveness because it is not measurable and integrated. Impact: High - Makes policy implementation inconsistent and incomplete.

- e. The relocation location is less economically strategic

Many street vendors refuse to be relocated because the new location is not on the main trade route, far from the crowds, and reduces their income. However, business continuity is highly dependent on customer access. This impacts the low participation of street vendors in the arrangement program. According to the theory of entrepreneurship and sustainable economics, microeconomic sustainability requires a viable and competitive business environment in the market. 4 If the location aspect is not considered, the relocation program will only be an administrative policy, not an economic solution. The impact is high. It causes failure of the relocation program and rejection by street vendors.

#### 4.4. Socio-Economic Impact of the Implementation of Regional Regulations on Street Vendors in Manokwari Regency

Implementing Regional Regulation Number 15 of 2021, which regulates the management and empowerment of street vendors (PKL) in Manokwari Regency, has significantly impacted the community's social and economic aspects, particularly the street vendors. This impact is divided into several main dimensions based on observations and interviews. Economically, the trade sector, including street vendors, has significantly contributed to Manokwari Regency's Gross Regional Domestic Product (GRDP) and provided substantial employment opportunities in the informal sector. Data shows that the presence of street vendors in strategic locations such as Wosi Village serves as a primary source of income for many families and provides easy access to daily necessities for residents (Zaenul et al., 2024). Street vendors are a microeconomic pillar, encouraging money circulation and reducing unemployment, especially amidst limited formal employment opportunities.

However, the government's relocation and restructuring of street vendors (PKL) has not always been well-received by all businesses. Some vendors have complained about decreased revenue due to new locations deemed less strategic, requiring them to work harder to attract fewer customers (Rahman, 2014; Ningsih, 2023). The economic impact is also felt through additional costs incurred by vendors, such as fees and adapting to new business facilities. This situation has led to resistance and economic uncertainty among street vendors, impacting the stability of their income. From a social perspective, street vendor restructuring has implications for changing patterns of social interaction within the street vendor community and with the public who use public spaces. Street vendor relocations that do not involve full vendor participation often trigger feelings of losing ownership of their business premises and their primary customer segment (Rahman, 2014). Conversely, a programmatic approach that integrates training, outreach, and empowerment positively impacts the entrepreneurial spirit and self-confidence of vendors (Ningsih, 2023). Therefore, the success of the Regional Regulation's implementation depends heavily on how these socio-economic empowerment aspects are accommodated.

Furthermore, the dynamic imbalance in competitiveness between local and non-local traders also has socio-economic impacts that require attention. This inequality creates social disparities that can potentially exacerbate local economic injustice and threaten the sustainability of street vendors' businesses, particularly for Papuan women who are the main business owners in Manokwari's traditional markets (Fenetiruma et al., 2022). Therefore, inclusive policies that are adaptive to local communities' varying socio-economic conditions are essential to ensure economic justice and sustainability. These complex socio-economic impacts emphasize that street vendor management cannot focus solely on physical planning and law enforcement. However, they must also address business owners' social and economic well-being. Appropriate interventions can increase street vendor productivity and income while maintaining harmonious public spaces and sustainable urban planning (Zaenul et al., 2024; Rahman, 2014; Ningsih, 2023).

#### 4.5. Comparison of Research Findings with Literature and Theoretical Contradictions

The findings of this study indicate that the implementation of Regional Regulation No. 15 of 2021 concerning the development and management of street vendors (PKL) in Manokwari Regency faces various real challenges, particularly related to legal understanding, inter-agency coordination, and socio-economic resistance from affected street vendors. This condition aligns with findings in the literature highlighting similar phenomena in the context of other cities in Indonesia, such as Tasikmalaya and Banjarmasin, where policies to regulate and manage street vendors are often challenging to implement effectively due to weak policy synergy, a lack of a participatory approach, and a mismatch between solutions and the economic needs of the street vendor community. Literature discourse confirms that although regional regulations aim to organize urban space and improve public order, these policies are often trapped in repressive control mechanisms that marginalize street vendors, without providing comprehensive solutions to their economic and social aspects. The phenomenon of "cat and mouse" between officials and street vendors that often arises due to unsustainable policies and the failure to involve street vendors in planning is a common feature also found in this study (Source 1). This reflects a structural conflict between the normative objectives of regulations and the socio-economic realities on the ground.

Based on a theoretical perspective, the theory of legal effectiveness and enforcement proposed by Soekanto and Friedman states that the success of law enforcement depends heavily on three main pillars: legal structure, legal substance, and a supportive legal culture (Soekanto, 2004; Friedman, 1975). Field findings indicate an imbalance between these three pillars, particularly a weak legal culture among street vendors who have not fully understood and accepted the applicable regulations. However, the theory expects that the success of a regulation depends on the internalization of norms by society and consistent enforcement by authorities. Significant contradictions are also evident in the implementation of development programs, which should be educational and empowering, but in practice are still dominated by enforcement actions that are sometimes sudden and unpersuasive. Literature, such as that presented by Wuradji and Djohani (2018), emphasizes the importance of a legal approach as a tool for empowerment, not simply control, so street vendors can develop independently and be competitive. However, this study shows that training and facilitation programs are still limited in quantity and reach, so the empowerment impact is not optimal.

Furthermore, the socio-economic aspects underlying the existence of street vendors are often overlooked in development policies that focus solely on the physical order and aesthetics of the city. The phenomenon of vendor resistance to relocation, citing the new location's non-strategic nature and impact on income, demonstrates the policy's inconsistency with the street vendors' real economic needs. Similar findings have been reported in studies in other regions, highlighting the importance of inclusive policies that sustainably accommodate the informal economy. Discursively, there is a mismatch between policy vision and implementation, which can be analyzed as a gap between law on the books versus law in action (Friedman, 1975). Regional regulations, as legal instruments, have provided a sound normative framework. However, the lack of socialization and participation of street vendors has prevented these laws from fully becoming a part of the lives of street vendors. This poses a significant challenge, as policy objectives are difficult to achieve without stakeholders' awareness and commitment.

Criticism of partial policies and the lack of cross-sectoral coordination is also highly relevant in this context. As found in various regions, without a strong coordination mechanism and a dialogue forum involving street vendors and multiple stakeholders, restructuring efforts are unsustainable and tend to lead to social conflict. Therefore, the literature encourages a shift in policy paradigm from a repressive top-down approach to participatory governance oriented toward socio-economic empowerment. Thus, the discourse between field findings and the literature confirms that successful street vendor restructuring requires an integration of legal, social, and economic aspects with an approach that is inclusive, sustainable, and sensitive to the local context. This study reinforces the critique of policies emphasizing only physical control and enforcement. It emphasizes the need for policy implementation with an advocacy approach, facilitation, and open dialogue to solve the complex problems street vendors face in urban areas.

## V. Conclusion

This study examines the effectiveness of the implementation of Regional Regulation Number 15 of 2021 concerning the Arrangement and Empowerment of Street Vendors (PKL) in Manokwari Regency from a legal perspective, technical implementation, and socio-economic impacts on these micro-enterprises. The analysis shows that although the regulation provides a sound normative framework, its implementation in the field still faces significant obstacles, such as low understanding and participation of street vendors, limited coordination between government agencies, and less strategic relocation locations, which hinder business continuity and optimal empowerment of street vendors. The imbalance between the normative objectives of the regulation and practice in the field reflects a gap between the law on the books and the law in action, ultimately affecting the effectiveness of guidance and protection for street vendors.

The socio-economic impact of implementing this regulation is evident in the contribution of street vendors to supporting the informal economy and reducing unemployment. However, it is also tinged with resistance and uncertainty due to changes in location and a less participatory and empowerment-based approach to management. Discourse analysis comparing field findings with the literature indicates that the dominant administrative and repressive policies have not fully accommodated the economic and social needs of street vendors. Therefore, the effectiveness of guidance can be improved by strengthening participatory and educational approaches, increasing synergy between agencies, and providing adequate facilitation tailored to local socio-economic characteristics. Suggestions for further research include deepening the study with a more exploratory and longitudinal approach to monitor long-term changes in the impact of policies on street vendors' economic and social lives. Further research could also examine public perception and participation regarding the arrangement of public spaces and the informal economy to obtain a more holistic picture. Furthermore, comparative analysis between regions with different socio-cultural characteristics can provide rich insights into best practices in organizing and empowering street vendors. A multidisciplinary approach integrating legal, economic, sociological, and urban planning perspectives would help design more inclusive and sustainable policies to support street vendor communities in autonomous regions such as Manokwari Regency.

## References

- Alrasyid, H. (2020). *Hukum administrasi negara dan penataan ruang publik*. Bandung: Refika Aditama.
- Badan Pusat Statistik Kabupaten Manokwari. (2024). *Kabupaten Manokwari dalam angka 2024*. Manokwari: BPS.
- Badan Pusat Statistik Papua Barat. (2024). *Statistik Kabupaten Manokwari 2024*. Manokwari: BPS Provinsi Papua Barat.
- Creswell, J. W. (2016). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches* (4th ed.). SAGE Publications.
- Dinas Perindustrian, Perdagangan, Koperasi dan UKM Kabupaten Manokwari. (2023). *Laporan program pembinaan PKL tahun 2023*. Manokwari: Dinas Perindagkop.
- Djohan, D. (2016). *Mewujudkan otonomi daerah yang berkualitas*. Jakarta: IPDN Press.
- Djohan, S. (2016). *Otonomi daerah dan dinamika pemerintahan lokal di Indonesia*. Jakarta: Rajawali Pers.
- Fadli, M. (2021). *Metode penelitian kualitatif: Pendekatan dan aplikasi*. Jakarta: Rajawali Pers.
- Fenetiruma, A., Suharto, M., & Tandililing, R. (2022). Ketimpangan akses dan daya saing pedagang lokal dan non-lokal di pasar tradisional Papua Barat. *Jurnal Ekonomi dan Pembangunan*, 15(2), 120–135.
- Florensa, D. (2020). Validitas dan reliabilitas dalam penelitian kualitatif: Pendekatan triangulasi dan member check. *Jurnal Metodologi Penelitian*, 5(2), 45–56.
- Friedman, L. M. (1975). *The legal system: A social science perspective*. New York: Russell Sage Foundation.
- Laporan Kegiatan Disperindagkop UKM Manokwari. (2023). *Laporan kegiatan Disperindagkop UKM Manokwari 2023*. Manokwari: Disperindagkop.
- Muslim, A. (2015). *Partisipasi dan pemberdayaan masyarakat*. Bandung: Alfabeta.

- Pemerintah Kabupaten Manokwari. (2021). Peraturan daerah nomor 15 tahun 2021 tentang penataan dan pemberdayaan pedagang kaki lima. Manokwari: Pemerintah Daerah Kabupaten Manokwari.
- Peraturan Daerah Kabupaten Manokwari Nomor 15 Tahun 2021 tentang Penataan dan Pemberdayaan Pedagang Kaki Lima, Pasal 3–10. (2021). Manokwari: Pemkab Manokwari.
- Republik Indonesia. (1945). Undang-Undang Dasar Negara Republik Indonesia Tahun 1945.
- Robbins, S. P. (1994). *Organizational behavior: Concepts, controversies, and applications* (7th ed.). Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Ryaas Rasyid, R. (2000). *Makna pemerintahan dan otonomi daerah*. Yogyakarta: UII Press.
- Rahardjo, S. (2007). *Hukum dan perubahan sosial*. Yogyakarta: Genta Publishing.
- Salman, A. (2020). Teknik analisis data kualitatif: Reduksi data dan pengkodean terbuka. *Jurnal Penelitian Sosial*, 8(1), 14–28.
- Soekanto, S. (2004). *Penelitian hukum normatif: Suatu tinjauan singkat*. Jakarta: Rajawali Pers.
- Soekanto, S. (2004). *Faktor-faktor yang mempengaruhi penegakan hukum*. Jakarta: RajaGrafindo Persada.
- Steers, R. M. (1977). *Organizational effectiveness: A behavioral view*. Santa Monica, CA: Goodyear Publishing Company.
- Tadjoeddin, Z. (2013). *Ekonomi politik pembangunan Indonesia*. Jakarta: LP3ES.
- Walidin, M., Saifullah, & Tabrani, M. (2015). Pendekatan kualitatif dalam penelitian sosial: Teori dan aplikasi. *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial dan Politik*, 12(3), 220–230.
- Wuradji, S., & Djohani, R. (2018). Pemberdayaan masyarakat melalui pendekatan hukum dan sosial ekonomi. *Jurnal Kebijakan dan Pemberdayaan*, 6(1), 45–58.
- Yenni, P. (2020). Strategi penataan dan pembinaan pedagang kaki lima di Papua Barat. *Jurnal Administrasi Publik*, 10(1), 70–85.
- Zaenul, M., Simanjuntak, R., & Harsono, P. (2024). Kontribusi sektor perdagangan dalam perekonomian Kabupaten Manokwari: Studi kasus pedagang kaki lima. *Jurnal Ekonomi Daerah*, 21(1), 55–73.
- Zimmerer, T. W., & Scarborough, N. M. (2005). *Essentials of entrepreneurship and small business management*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall.