OPEN ACCESS

HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT | RESEARCH ARTICLE

Collaboration of Stakeholders and AI in The Implementation of New Public Service in The Digital Era

M. Faruq[1*], Bintoro Wardiyanto[2], Siti Hatijah Umpain[3], Muchammad Toyib[4]

[1,3,4] Department of Human Resource Development, Universitas Airlangga, Surabaya. Indonesia.
Email: m.faruq-2023@pasca.unair.ac.id[1] siti.hatijah.umpain-2023@pasca.unair.ac.id[3]
muchammad.toyib-2023@pasca.unair.ac.id[4]
[2] Department of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Airlangga, Surabaya. Indonesia. Email:
bintoro.wardiyanto@fisip.unair.ac.id

Abstract: This study emphasizes the importance of applying the New Public Service (NPS) concept in public service management in the digital era through a Systematic Literature Review (SLR) of five articles from Scopus (2021-2024). The analysis indicates that NPS can enhance the quality of public services in an inclusive, collaborative, and responsive manner. NPS promotes stakeholder collaboration, AI integration in services, and citizen involvement in public value creation. The main challenges in implementing NPS are bureaucratic cultural resistance and insufficient policy dissemination. This study underscores the need for leaders to develop strong commitment, improve effective communication, strengthen cross-sector collaboration, and involve the community in the transition towards NPS. Furthermore, the research highlights the necessity of an integrated public service ecosystem framework to facilitate collaboration among the government, private sector, and society, providing innovative solutions to public service challenges in the digital era.

Keywords: Human Resource Development, Public Service Management, Literature Review.

JEL Classification Code: E44, F31, F37, G15

1. INTRODUCTION

Public service is a crucial element in the execution of governmental duties, aiming to meet the needs and well-being of society at large. Throughout history, paradigms in public service have undergone various transformations, reflecting shifts in social, political, and economic dynamics (Zulfaa and Azzahra 2024) Initially, traditional public administration dominated public service delivery by relying on a rigid bureaucratic and hierarchical system. This model was rooted in Weberian principles that emphasized formal rules, rigid procedures, and hierarchical organizational structures (Widodo 2022). Although traditional public administration offered advantages such as stability and task clarity, this approach has increasingly been viewed as inadequate in addressing the needs of modern society (Wahab 2021).

Modern society demands more efficient, transparent, and responsive public services. These demands have driven the emergence of a new paradigm known as New Public Management (NPM) (Sepriano et al. 2023). NPM adopts private sector management principles within the public sector, aiming to enhance the efficiency and effectiveness of service delivery (Ferlie 2017). The central focus of NPM is on results and outputs, emphasizing competition, reducing the role of the state in certain areas, and empowering public managers to make more flexible decisions (Rachman 2021). This paradigm offers several advantages, including improved operational efficiency and cost reduction. However, NPM has also faced significant criticism for its market-oriented approach and insufficient attention to public values (Ridwan Kurnia Rahim 2023). The New Public Management (NPM) approach has been implemented across various countries with mixed results. Research by Osborne et

al., (2022) indicates that while NPM can enhance efficiency, its implementation may also lead to a decline in the quality of public services. Conversely, Koskimies & Kinder, (2024) emphasize the importance of the concept of mutuality in the development and implementation of public service solutions supported by artificial intelligence (AI). This mutuality concept entails agreement and collaboration between the government, the private sector, and the community to ensure the successful adoption of effective AI solutions in public services. In their study, mutuality represents a relationship of mutual trust and support among the involved stakeholders. Although extensive research has been conducted on New Public Management (NPM) and the application of artificial intelligence (AI) in public services, the concept of New Public Service (NPS), which emphasizes ethical values, democracy, and active public participation in the delivery of public services, still requires deeper exploration. This study aims to introduce and analyze the NPS paradigm in the context of public service management in the digital era. The scientific novelty of this article lies in its emphasis on active public participation and collaboration among stakeholders to create sustainable public value. The research seeks to address the following questions: (1) How can the implementation of the New Public Service (NPS) concept improve the quality of public services in the digital era? (2) What are the challenges and obstacles in applying NPS in public institutions that still adhere to traditional bureaucratic cultures? (3) How can collaboration between the government, private sector, and community be optimized to support the implementation of NPS?

This article aims to evaluate the implementation of the New Public Service (NPS) concept in public service management in the digital era, identify the various challenges and obstacles that arise, and propose solutions to optimize stakeholder collaboration in creating sustainable and beneficial public value.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

This literature review provides an overview of the concept of mutuality in the development of public services supported by artificial intelligence (AI). This section discusses in depth the principles of mutuality, benefits, implementation challenges, and the relevance of this concept in the context of public services in the digital era.

2.1. The Concept of Mutuality in New AI Powered Public Service Solutions

One concept that is increasingly relevant in the development of modern public services is mutuality, as discussed by Koskimies & Kinder (2024). Mutuality in the context of public services supported by artificial intelligence (AI) emphasizes the importance of cooperation and support between the government, the private sector, and the community. This relationship of mutual trust and support is an important foundation for creating innovative and sustainable solutions in public services, especially in the digital era. With AI increasingly integrated into public service processes, strong collaboration between various stakeholders is essential for the successful implementation of these solutions. The concept of mutuality includes several important aspects that must be considered in developing AI-based public service solutions. First, all parties involved must be involved from the beginning in the problem identification process. This includes the government, the community, and the private sector, who together must understand and identify the challenges before designing AI-powered solutions. By involving all parties, the solutions developed are more likely to meet real needs in the field. Second, knowledge sharing and mutual interaction are key elements in effective collaboration. Through the exchange of knowledge and information, each party can contribute based on their respective expertise and perspectives, which will ultimately enrich the solution development process. Open dialogue between parties is also needed to expand the scope of cooperation and build trust. This is important to avoid conflicts and ensure that all parties feel valued and involved in the collaboration process.

Another important aspect is a deep understanding of the local political, social and cultural context. These factors are crucial in designing solutions that are relevant and acceptable to the community. Without this understanding, the solutions developed may not be effective in the desired context. The advantage of the mutuality concept is its focus on trust and cooperation. By building a relationship

OPEN ACCESS

of mutual trust, the solutions developed have a greater chance of being accepted and implemented effectively. In addition, a problem-based approach that involves all parties in the problem identification process also ensures that the solutions developed are truly answers to existing challenges. Collaboration across disciplines and sectors can also encourage innovation and the development of richer solutions. However, the implementation of the concept of mutuality also faces several challenges. Coordination and integration between various parties are often obstacles, especially in complex and politically and culturally diverse contexts. In addition, limited resources, both time and cost, can be obstacles to implementing effective collaboration.

2.2. Public Service Ecosystem Framework

The public service ecosystem framework proposed by Osborne et al. (2022) describes public service as a dynamic interaction between various parties to create value. This framework includes four interrelated levels, namely the institutional level, the service level, the individual level, and the belief level. These levels work together to create sustainable public value through collaboration between various actors in a constantly changing environment. At the institutional level, existing social and institutional values and rules influence the creation of value in public services. At the service level, the processes and key actors involved in creating value in public services become the main focus. Meanwhile, at the individual level, the values created and felt by individuals in the context of public services become the main concern. Finally, at the belief level, the beliefs and values that underlie the interaction between various stakeholders become important elements in creating a dynamic public service ecosystem.

2.3. Co-Production of Public Services and Co-Creation of Public Value

The concept of co-production and co-creation introduced by Palumbo & Manesh (2023) emphasizes the importance of citizen involvement in the provision of public services. In this approach, citizens are not only considered as recipients of services but also as important contributors in the process of designing and evaluating services. Co-production encourages collaboration between service providers and communities, leveraging the various perspectives and skills that exist within the community to create solutions that are more effective and appropriate to community needs.

2.4. New Public Service Bargain

The New Public Service Bargain (NPSB) introduced by Johnston (2023) offers a new approach to human resource management in the public sector. NPSB focuses on talent management, public service motivation, and pro-social behavior to attract and retain competent personnel. This approach includes effective human resource development, appreciation of public service values, and community-oriented behavior.

3. RESEARCH METHOD AND MATERIALS

This research was conducted using the Systematic Literature Review (SLR) method, which involves the collection and analysis of previous studies related to a specific topic to answer the predetermined research questions (Klumpner, Wijekoon, & Wheeler 2006). The Systematic Review method consists of five steps as described by Tranfield et al. (2003):

a. *Identify the Research Topic and Scope*
At this stage, an expert panel is formed to provide specific knowledge. Review questions are formulated to guide the study. The planning process, search criteria for inclusion and exclusion, and analytical techniques are outlined during this phase.

b. Develop the Conceptual Framework

This study utilizes data from the Scopus database to verify the validity and relevance of the data. The search was conducted in Scopus using the keyword "New Public Service" and focused on articles published between 2021 and 2024 to ensure novelty. The authors identified five articles relevant to the research topic. The selected articles were those directly related to the research objectives and the NPS concept. Reviewing these articles is essential to enhance understanding in answering the research questions.

c. Develop the Protocol

The research was evaluated based on predefined parameters. Data extraction and synthesis revealed that from the keyword search "New Public Service" in Scopus, the researcher used strict inclusion criteria, selecting only articles published between 2021 and 2024 to ensure the novelty of the study. Additionally, the selected articles were open access and relevant to the research topic. After a rigorous selection process, the researcher found five articles that met the inclusion criteria. These articles will be thoroughly analyzed in relation to the research topic.

d. Conduct the Systematic review

At this stage, information from the research is transferred into a predefined form. Meta-analysis or qualitative synthesis methods are employed to combine results from various studies.

e. Interpreting and Using the Review

The final step involves interpreting and utilizing the results of the systematic review and setting the direction for future research. The following sections will further explore stages 3.4 and 3.5.

4. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

4.1. Research findings

Based on the results of the synthesis and in-depth analysis of the five reviewed articles, the researcher found the suitability of the method used, namely the qualitative method. This method allows for the collection of diverse and in-depth data, thus helping researchers in contextualizing the research results. The reviewed articles were published in 2021, 2022, 2023, and 2024, which shows the diversity of journals from one to another. Overall, these five articles provide an overview of the New Public Service (NPS), with several main conclusions, namely the importance of transforming the paradigm from a bureaucratic-centered public service to a more inclusive, collaborative, and responsive public service; the importance of cooperation and support; the importance of considering the use of AI in public services; the importance of mutuality in public services; and the importance of co-production involvement. These findings provide very important insights into the concept of NPS, and the following is an explanation of the research questions.

Table 1. Journal Analysis Table

Author	Method	Result
Benson et al., (2021)	Qualitative	The concept of the traditional paradigm to responsive and collaborative.
Johnston, (2023)		The importance of cooperation, support, trusting relationships and attention to technical and social aspects of AI applications.
Koskimies & Kinder, (2024)		Need cooperation and support. There are 4 ways of mutuality concept.
Osborne et al., (2022)		Public services as an ecosystem. Stakeholder collaboration: focus on values and rules, service improvement, individual values and stakeholder values.

Author	Method	Result
Palumbo & Manesh, (2023)		It requires citizen involvement, co-production, public value co-creation and paradigm transformation.

Source: Scopus (2024)

4.2. Discussion of research findings

a. *Can the implementation of the New Public Service (NPS) concept improve the quality of public services in the digital era?*

The implementation of the New Public Service (NPS) idea has great potential to improve the quality of public services in the digital era. Based on (Benson et al. 2021), NPS focuses on moral principles, democracy, and service to the community that can produce positive changes in the provision of public services. By involving the community more actively and responsively, NPS enables participation in the provision of services, strengthening the relationship between government, the private sector, and the community. According to Johnston, (2023) his research introduces a new paradigm that emphasizes transparency, accountability, and a focus on concrete public values in the implementation of public services. In other words, the implementation of New Public Service (NPS) can increase the efficiency, effectiveness, and accountability of public services. Koskimies & Kinder, (2024) stated that the use of artificial intelligence (AI) technology in public service solutions can improve the quality of services and responsiveness to community needs in the digital era.

New Public Service (NPS) encourages collaboration between various stakeholders to create sustainable public value. Through close collaboration between government, the private sector, and civil society, public management can become more responsive to environmental changes and societal demands (Osborne et al. 2022). In addition, community participation in designing and delivering public services can be enhanced through the concept of co-production in NPS, so that the quality of services provided remains relevant (Palumbo and Manesh 2023). It can be concluded that the implementation of New Public Service (NPS) can improve the quality of public services in the digital era by emphasizing citizen democracy, community participation, and civil organizations. NPS prioritizes humanitarian values, cross-sector collaboration, and responsiveness to community needs to create adaptive, inclusive, and innovative services. One example of concrete implementation is through the "smart city" project in Indonesia, where the government collaborates with the technology sector and society to develop solutions such as infrastructure reporting applications and smart transportation systems. Despite facing challenges from bureaucratic and political culture, with strong determination and a collaborative approach, NPS can create positive changes in the provision of more efficient, effective, and accountable public services in the digital era. An example from Seo, (2023) shows the importance of implementing the "smart city" concept which has succeeded in improving the quality of life of the community and efficiency in city management. The awards won by the cities of Malang and Surabaya in implementing "smart cities" (Pramesti et al., 2020) are clear evidence that the implementation of NPS can improve the quality of public services.

b. *What are the challenges and obstacles in implementing NPS in public institutions that still have a traditional bureaucratic culture?*

The implementation of New Public Service (NPS) in government agencies that still adhere to traditional bureaucratic culture faces various significant obstacles (Agus 2019). According to research conducted by Benson et al., (2021), the main obstacle in implementing a more flexible and inclusive NPS approach is the existence of a rigid and hierarchical bureaucratic culture. Resistance to change by traditional bureaucratic culture can hinder progress and innovation in public services. Lack of socialization of new policies is also an obstacle in public institutions with conservative cultures and bureaucracies. Palumbo & Manesh, (2023) highlight the importance of providing accurate and timely information to the public and public officials regarding policy changes that will soon be implemented. Inaccuracy in explanation and communication can hinder the acceptance and use of NPS. In solving these problems, a high level of commitment, sufficient resource allocation, and implementation of appropriate strategies are required (Ramadhani and Soenarto 2023). Osborne et al., (2022) highlighted the importance of ongoing efforts in changing cultures and systems that have been rooted for a long time. By understanding these obstacles, public institutions can plan concrete steps to

overcome them in implementing NPS and achieve more responsive, efficient, and quality public services.

Public institutions that implement New Public Service (NPS) and still adhere to traditional bureaucratic culture face significant challenges, especially related to the rigidity of bureaucratic culture and resistance to change. For example, in the Department of Education, there was resistance from employees who were accustomed to old procedures when implementing a new system aimed at increasing transparency and public participation. The lack of dissemination of information regarding new policies also hampers effective acceptance and implementation. Successful efforts in this regard often involve two-way communication, as outlined by Noer, (2022) which includes important stages such as involving relevant parties, holding meetings, and decision-making. Openness of information also contributes to building trust and transparency, which supports the creation of participation or involvement (Maya Septiani 2020). In addition, the application of a co-production approach in designing policies, such as education policies, is also very important. Close collaboration between the government, relevant non-governmental organizations, and local communities can strengthen support and improve the quality of services. Community involvement in decision-making can also increase the success of policy implementation.

c. *How can collaboration between government, private sector, and communities be optimized to support NPS implementation?*

Collaboration between government, the private sector, and the community plays an important role in maximizing the implementation of the New Public Service (NPS) concept. Research shows that strategies to strengthen this collaboration must begin with building trust among all parties involved in the delivery of public services. Benson et al., (2021) emphasize that open dialogue and transparency are key elements to enhancing collaboration, as they enable various parties to work together more effectively in achieving common goals. In addition, Johnston, (2023) highlighted the significance of implementing the New Public Service Bargain (NPSB) in attracting and retaining qualified staff in the public sector. NPSB emphasizes talent management and motivation in public service, which can strengthen cooperation between government, the private sector, and the community. With an emphasis on effective human resource development and public service values, cooperation between parties can be enhanced.

According to Koskimies & Kinder, (2024) the role of artificial intelligence (AI) is crucial in the context of public service solutions from a technological perspective. Collaboration in implementing AI solutions not only contributes to increased efficiency, but also to responsibility in providing services. By utilizing innovative technology, various parties can collaborate to produce innovative solutions that are able to face challenges in public services more efficiently. On the other hand, Osborne et al., (2022) emphasize the importance of collaboration between government, private sector, and society to create sustainable public value. The article proposes the need for an integrated public service ecosystem framework system to support such collaboration. With effective reciprocal cooperation, this framework can facilitate the participation of various parties to achieve significant results. Through the implementation of an organized strategy and involving all parties, the implementation of the New Public Service (NPS) concept can be carried out successfully to improve the quality of public services as a whole. To improve collaboration between the government, private sector, and community in supporting the implementation of New Public Service (NPS), concrete steps can be implemented. The government can facilitate open and honest dialogue between all parties to strengthen trust and improve cooperation. For example, holding regular discussion meetings involving representatives of the private sector and the community to discuss issues related to public services. The private sector can play a role in improving the performance of public services by providing technology and best management practices, and collaborating with the government in developing digital solutions. Active community involvement in the planning, implementation, and evaluation of public services is invaluable, such as in smart city projects where local communities participate in designing smart application features. Through solid collaboration with the NPS approach, the implementation of NPS can optimally improve the quality of public services. Inclusive, responsive, and collaborative cooperation between all stakeholders allows for innovative solutions to

OPEN ACCESS

overcome the challenges of public services in the digital era. Although there are differences in perceptions and interests in collaboration, this can produce better solutions Hertati, (2024).

5. CONCLUSION

The implementation of New Public Service (NPS), which prioritizes ethical values, democracy, and active community participation, has the potential to improve the quality of public services in the digital era through collaboration between the government, private sector, and the community. However, this implementation faces significant challenges due to the bureaucratic culture that is still rigid and less flexible. To overcome this, it is necessary to identify the right problems, training to increase capacity and understanding, change the organizational culture to be more inclusive and responsive, and improve policies that support this transformation. The research findings emphasize the importance of leadership in building commitment, improving effective communication, strengthening cross-sector cooperation, and actively involving the community to achieve significant improvements in the overall quality of public services. These findings have significant implications for public policy development, where the government needs to adopt and integrate NPS principles more comprehensively. Although this study has limitations in the available literature data that are relevant to the Indonesian context and the lack of empirical studies in the field, the results of this study are expected to encourage further research that includes more in-depth empirical studies, covering a wider area. In addition, future research should explore new technologies such as artificial intelligence and Blockchain to further optimize the application of NPS in public services.

REFERENCES

Agus, A. (2019). Patologi Birokrasi Dan Agenda Strategi: Kolaborasi Pendekatan New Public Management Dan New Public Service Melalui Model Citizens Charter. Politea: Jurnal Politik Islam, 2(1), 77–90.

Benson, L., Thanh, H. T., & Thao, B. N. (2021). Public Management: A New Public Service Oriented Concept of Public Service. Journal of Asian Multicultural Research for Economy and Management Study, 2(3), 29–36. https://doi.org/10.47616/jamrems.v2i3.124

Ferlie, E. (2017). The New Public Management and Public Management Studies. Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Business and Management. https://doi.org/10.1093/acrefore/9780190224851.013.129

Hertati, D. (2024). Reformasi Birokrasi Tataran Pemerintahan. Thalibul Ilmi Publishing & Education.

Johnston, K. (2023). New Public Service Bargain: Time for Paradigm Shift in Turbulent Times? Transylvanian Review of Administrative Sciences, 2023(Special Issue), 85–100. https://doi.org/10.24193/tras.SI2023.5

Klumpner, C., Wijekoon, T., & Wheeler, P. (2006). New Methods for the Active Compensation of Unbalanced Supply Voltages for Two-Stage Direct Power Converters (Vol. 126). Keele University and Durham University Joint Report.

Koskimies, E., & Kinder, T. (2024). Mutuality in AI-Enabled New Public Service Solutions. Public Management Review, 26(1), 219–44. https://doi.org/10.1080/14719037.2022.2078501

Maya Septiani. (2020). Strategi Mewujudkan Transparansi Dan Partisipasi Dalam Pelayanan Publik. Jum'at, 31-01-2020, 1.

Noer, K. U. (2022). Partisipasi Publik: Model, Pendekatan, Dan Praksis.

Osborne, S. P., Powell, M., Cui, T., & Strokosch, K. (2022). Value Creation in the Public Service Ecosystem: An Integrative Framework. Public Administration Review, 82(4), 634–645. https://doi.org/10.1111/puar.13474

Palumbo, R., & Fakhar Manesh, M. (2023). Travelling along the Public Service Co-Production Road: A Bibliometric Analysis and Interpretive Review. Public Management Review, 25(7), 1348–1384. https://doi.org/10.1080/14719037.2021.2015222

Pramesti, D. R., Kasiwi, A. N., & Purnomo, E. P. (2020). Perbandingan Implementasi Smart City Di Indonesia: Studi Kasus: Perbandingan Smart People Di Kota Surabaya Dan Kota Malang. Ijd-Demos, 2(2), 163–173. https://doi.org/10.37950/ijd.v2i2.61

Rachman, M. (2021). Manajemen Pelayanan Publik.

Ramadhani, S., & Soenarto, I. (2023). Penerapan Program Employee Engagement Untuk Meningkatkan Motivasi Kerja Karyawan Pada Pt Abc. Jurnal Administrasi Bisnis Terapan (JABT), 5(2), 8.

Ridwan Kurnia Rahim, M. F. A. (2023). Teori New Public Management: Evaluasi Dan Tantangan Dalam Konteks Pelayanan Publik. FisiPublik : Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Dan Politik, 8(2).

Seo, A. (2023). Smart City Initiatives in Indonesia: Concept, Benefits, and Implementation. Savasa Smart

Lifestyle.

Sepriano, S., Hikmat, A., Munizu, M., Nooraini, A., Sundari, S., Afiyah, S., Riwayati, A., & Indarti, C. F. S. (2023). Transformasi Administrasi Publik Menghadapi Era Digital. PT. Sonpedia Publishing Indonesia.

Tranfield, D., Denyer, D., & Smart, P. (2003). Towards a Methodology for Developing Evidence-Informed Management Knowledge by Means of Systematic Review. British Journal of Management, 14(3), 207–222. https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-8551.00375

Wahab, S. A. (2021). Analisis Kebijakan: Dari Formulasi Ke Penyusunan Model-Model Implementasi Kebijakan Publik. Bumi Aksara.

Widodo, J. (2022). Membangun Birokrasi Berbasis Kinerja Cet. 1 Edisi Revisi. Media Nusa Creative (MNC Publishing).

Zulfaa, A. F., & Azzahra, K. (2024). Implementasi Nilai Kebangsaan Bhinneka Tunggal Ika Dalam Peningkatan Pelayanan Publik. Causa: Jurnal Hukum Dan Kewarganegaraan, 3(3), 40–50.