

Implementation of The Role of The North Sumatra Regional Office of The Ministry of Law and Human Rights in The Formation of Regional Regulations on The Spatial Plan of Gunung Sitoli City, Indonesia

Rio Saputra Manullang¹, Janpatar Simamora²

^{1,2}Department of Law, Faculty of Law, Universitas HKBP Nommensen, Medan, Indonesia.
Email: riosaputra.manullang@student.uhn.ac.id¹, patarmora@uhn.ac.id²

ARTICLE HISTORY

Received: December 30, 2024

Revised: February 16, 2025

Accepted: February 28, 2025

DOI

<https://doi.org/10.52970/grdis.v5i2.1112>

ABSTRACT

Harmonizing regional regulations is important to ensure that local regulations do not conflict with national policies and regulations. The focus of this research is the role of the North Sumatra Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights in harmonizing Gunung Sitoli City Regional Regulation Number 12 of 2012 concerning the Regional Spatial Plan (RTRW). This research investigates documents through a descriptive qualitative approach to provide an in-depth overview of the harmonization process, the challenges faced, and the impact of policy implementation. The research results show that the North Sumatra Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights is key in aligning regional spatial planning regulations (Perda RTRW) with national regulations. The harmonization process involves a review of substance and technical aspects, the preparation of recommendations, and coordination between local governments and related agencies. However, the research also identified various constraints, such as limited resources and differences in technical interpretation, that affect the effectiveness of harmonization. The effectiveness evaluation shows that the harmonization process successfully improved the alignment of RTRW regional regulations with national policies, although some minor adjustments are needed. The positive impact of this harmonization includes improved coordination between government agencies and a more substantial legal basis for implementing RTRW. The recommendations from this study include improvements in the harmonization process and policy adjustments to address the identified implementation challenges. This research is expected to enhance the understanding of regulatory harmonization mechanisms and improve the effectiveness of spatial planning policies in Gunung Sitoli City through the strategic role of the Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights.

Keywords: Regional Regulation, Regional Spatial Planning, Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights, Gunung Sitoli City, National Policy.

I. Introduction

The Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights of North Sumatra is a regional representative of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights (Kemenkumham), an institution responsible for carrying out some of the ministry's authority in the province of North Sumatra (Yasser, 2021). This regional office plays a role in various fields, including legal development, immigration services, correctional facilities, and the protection and promotion of human rights. In legal development, the Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights in North Sumatra supervises correctional institutions (LP) and detention centers (Rutan) and conducts rehabilitation for prisoners and detainees. In the field of immigration, this regional office manages and supervises immigration units, such as Immigration Offices, which provide passport, visa, and residence permit services. In addition, the Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights of North Sumatra also provides legal services, such as intellectual property legal protection and assistance for underprivileged communities (Simamora & Manullang, 2024). Led by a Head of Regional Office, this agency is also responsible for coordinating with local governments and institutions to ensure the implementation of legal and human rights policies at the local level runs smoothly. Harmonization of regional regulations is an important process to ensure that the regulations at the regional level do not contradict the policies and regulations in force throughout the country (Mayang, 2024). In the context of regional spatial planning, this harmonization becomes increasingly crucial, considering that regional spatial planning serves as a guide in managing and optimizing space from economic, social, and environmental perspectives. According to (Bangun, 2024), spatial planning is an effort to regulate land and space use to ensure the efficiency and effectiveness of spatial resource utilization. Spatial planning aims to create order in space utilization, supporting sustainable development. According to (Febrianti and Nurlaila, 2024), sound governance principles in spatial planning are necessary to ensure community participation, transparency, and accountability in spatial planning and control. Good spatial planning also considers public and environmental interests. According to (F. A. E. Tambunan, 2024), spatial planning must be based on constitutional principles, including protecting the community's rights to a safe and beneficial environment. Spatial planning that does not comply with the Constitution will undermine the principles of the rule of law. Therefore, it can be concluded that regional regulations related to spatial planning must align with national development policies to create a balance between economic growth and environmental preservation and prevent conflicts of interest that could harm the community and the region (Thea & SH, 2024).

Gunung Sitoli City, one of the developing areas in North Sumatra Province, has challenges in regional spatial planning. Sound and sustainable spatial planning has become a priority with a continuously increasing population and the need for infrastructure development. To address this, the Gunung Sitoli City Government enacted Regional Regulation No. 12 of 2012 concerning the Regional Spatial Plan (RTRW), which regulates the utilization and management of the city's spatial area over a certain period. However, implementing the RTRW is not without challenges, especially in terms of alignment with the applicable national development policies and the Law on Spatial Planning as the legal basis. Astuti et al. (Hariyanto, 2022) explain that in the context of regional autonomy, spatial planning becomes the responsibility of the local government. However, it must still refer to the national spatial planning policy. The North Sumatra Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights coordinates regional regulations with higher regulations, including the Regional Spatial Planning Regulation (Perda RTRW). The Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights ensures that the regional regulations do not conflict with the applicable national and regional regulations and support sustainable development. This role is not limited to supervision but also includes the processes of coaching, consultation, and providing recommendations to local governments regarding the drafting of regulations. Harmonizing regulations in spatial planning is essential because misaligned spatial planning can lead to various problems, ranging from land use conflicts and development imbalances to environmental damage. According to (Drawi et al., 2024), harmonizing regional regulations and national laws is very important in spatial governance to ensure that local rules do not contradict the reinforced national laws. Therefore, the success of harmonizing regional regulations becomes a determining factor in the implementation of RTRW in

Gunung Sitoli City, which aims to create more directed and sustainable regional development. This research mainly evaluates how the North Sumatra Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights is responsible for harmonizing the City Regulation of Gunung Sitoli Number 12 of 2012 concerning Spatial Planning. This research will also identify various obstacles encountered in the harmonization process and how this impacts the implementation of spatial planning policies in Gunung Sitoli City. As a result, this research is expected to enhance our understanding of the regulation harmonization process and the role of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights in creating spatial governance that complies with applicable laws (Sumiati et al., 2021).

This study focuses on how the North Sumatra Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights harmonizes the City of Gunung Sitoli Regional Regulation Number 12 of 2012 concerning the Regional Spatial Plan (H. K. R. Tambunan, 2021). This question arises due to the challenges in implementing the RTRW that require legal intervention from the Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights to ensure the alignment of policies and regulations (Murjani & Saporuddin, 2021). In answering this question, the objective of this research is to determine how well the role of the North Sumatra Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights is executed in the process of harmonizing regional regulations related to RTRW in the city of Gunung Sitoli (Enggartias, 2021). This research provides a more comprehensive understanding of the importance of harmonizing regional regulations in spatial planning and the strategic role played by the Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights in the process (Helmi, 2021). Additionally, this research is expected to provide recommendations for improving and strengthening the regulation harmonization process in the future so that the implementation of Spatial Planning and Zoning (RTRW) in Gunung Sitoli City can proceed more effectively and by the applicable legal principles (KHAIRI, 2024).

II. Research Method

The research method used is descriptive qualitative. The purpose of this research is to provide an in-depth understanding of the role of the North Sumatra Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights in the process of harmonizing Regional Regulations (City of Gunung Sitoli Regulation No. 12 of 2012 on the Regional Spatial Plan (RTRW)). (Jalinus & Risdendra, 2020; Waris & Islam, 2022.) Descriptive qualitative research emphasizes understanding problems in social life by utilizing broad, complex, and detailed conditions of reality and natural settings (Wu & Memon, 2022). According to (Welfin, 2023), descriptive research is conducted carefully and meticulously and, therefore, more accurate than ordinary observation. The qualitative approach was chosen because it allows for a thorough analysis of the interactions and dynamics between the parties involved in the harmonization process. This approach also allows for a deeper understanding of the roles and obstacles in policy implementation (Saad & Strauss, 2020).

III. Results and Discussion

4.1. Results

This research provides an overview of the role of the North Sumatra Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights in the harmonization process of the Gunung Sitoli City Regional Regulation (Perda) Number 12 of 2012 concerning the Regional Spatial Plan (RTRW) through document studies. The document study reviews relevant policies, the harmonization process, and the challenges in implementing those policies (Guseva, 2022). Here are the discussion results based on the data analysis from the reviewed documents.

1. The Role of the Regional Office in the Harmonization Process

According to document research, the Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights of North Sumatra plays an important role in harmonizing the RTRW Regional Regulation of Gunung Sitoli City.

As a vertical institution responsible for law enforcement and regulation drafting, the Regional Office is a balancing entity to ensure that the drafted Regional Regulation (Perda) aligns with national policies and higher legal regulations, such as the Spatial Planning Law. The harmonization includes a substantive and technical review of the RTRW regional regulation and the preparation of recommendations to ensure compliance with national regulations. The harmonization policy document explains that the harmonization process involves an in-depth review of the content of regional regulations to ensure that regional spatial planning rules do not conflict with national principles. This document highlights the role of the Regional Office in conducting legal reviews and providing input on the technical and substantive aspects of the regional regulation.

2. Process and Mechanism of Harmonization

According to the analysis of policy documents, the Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights of North Sumatra conducts the harmonization process in several stages. First, coordination is carried out between the Gunung Sitoli City Government and the Regional Office regarding harmonizing the RTRW regional regulation. Second, the Regional Office prepares recommendations based on the review of the RTRW documents aimed at identifying potential regulatory conflicts between local regulations and higher regulations, such as Law No. 26 of 2007 on Spatial Planning. The analyzed policy documents also indicate that the harmonization mechanism involves inter-agency meetings facilitated by the Regional Office to discuss the obstacles and challenges that arise during the drafting process of local regulations. This process ensures that harmonization proceeds according to established procedures and focuses on aligning regional regulations and national policies (Panagopoulos & Tzionas, 2023).

3. Challenges and Obstacles in Harmonization

One of the main themes identified from the document analysis is the various obstacles encountered in the harmonization process. Policy documents note that resource limitations in terms of technical and personnel are the main obstacles to optimally carrying out the harmonization process. In addition, changes in national regulations often require adjustments to the regional regulations that have been formulated, thereby slowing down the harmonization process (Prasetyanti, 2021). Document studies also reveal differences in the interpretation of technical aspects of RTRW among the parties involved. This obstacle necessitates additional discussions and clarifications to ensure that the resulting regulations can be accepted and implemented effectively (RINI, 2020).

4. Effectiveness of Harmonization

The thematic analysis of policy documents shows that the Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights of North Sumatra has done a harmonization process to enhance the alignment of the Gunung Sitoli City Spatial Planning Regulation (Perda RTRW) with national legislation. The effectiveness of this harmonization is reflected in the alignment of regional spatial planning policies with the spatial planning principles applicable at the national level (Mulyana, 2018). Additionally, the document notes that this harmonization provides a more substantial legal basis for implementing spatial planning policies in the City of Gunung Sitoli, which is expected to support more directed and sustainable regional development. The evaluation of the effectiveness of harmonization shows that although there were some obstacles in its implementation, the result of this harmonization process is positive, where higher regulations implemented the RTRW regional regulation well. Harmonization also improves coordination between the Gunung Sitoli City Government and related agencies in implementing spatial planning policies (Priadi et al., 2024).

5. The Impact of Harmonization on RTR Implementation

The results of the document study show that the harmonization carried out by the Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights of North Sumatra on the implementation of the City Spatial Plan (RTRW) of Gunung Sitoli improves the alignment between regional regulations (Perda) and national policies. This harmonization process positively impacts regional spatial planning, where the resulting RTRW policy can support more directed, sustainable, and nationally aligned development planning (Kariem & Ishmatuddin, 2021). This successful harmonization also facilitates coordination between government agencies in implementing spatial planning policies while providing a more substantial legal basis for implementing RTRW in the City of Gunung Sitoli. With this alignment, the RTRW policy is expected to support regional development that meets local and national needs effectively. The validity of this research is achieved by verifying information from various official documents (Sukayana et al., 2023). A thorough analysis was conducted on each document to ensure that the contents of the RTRW Regional Regulation and higher legislation were in accordance. To ensure data validity, the following steps have been taken:

a. Data Validity

- **Comparison Between Documents:** Every document used in this research is examined to ensure that the information provided is consistent with other documents. For example, data from the RTRW Regional Regulation is compared with national spatial planning policy documents to ensure consistency (Putra, 2019). Harmonization policy documents are used as references to verify that the steps taken by the Regional Office in the harmonization process have followed the established procedures.
- **Compliance with National Policy:** In addition, the alignment between the RTRW regional regulation and national policies, such as Law No. 26 of 2007 on Spatial Planning, is tested for data validity. If there is a strong alignment between the two, the harmonization process is considered valid by the applicable standards (Nugroho & Pradana, 2021).

b. Data Reliability

The data sources for this research are considered stable and consistent because they are official documents published by government agencies and legal institutions. Here are some aspects that are considered in maintaining data reliability:

- **Use of Official and Trusted Documents:** All the data analyzed comes from reliable sources, such as government regulations and policy documents issued by the North Sumatra Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights. Because these documents are published formally and follow strict administrative procedures, the reliability level of the information provided is considered high.
- **Consistence of Information Across Sources:** Reliability is also tested through the consistency of information obtained from various documents. For example, information about the harmonization steps taken by the Regional Office is consistent across all the analyzed documents. This shows that the data collected can be relied upon, as it is supported by various sources that provide similar information.

c. Triangulation of Documents

Document triangulation is used in this research to ensure the validity and credibility of the data by comparing various written data sources related to the harmonization of Regional Regulation (Perda) of Gunung Sitoli City Number 12 of 2012 concerning the Regional Spatial Plan (RTRW). Document triangulation is also used to evaluate the effectiveness of procedures, ensure that higher regulations are by the RTRW Regional Regulation, and ensure that the information is consistent.

The local policy that must be aligned with the national policy is Regional Regulation No. 12 of 2012 concerning the Regional Spatial Plan (RTRW) of Gunung Sitoli City. This document includes zoning regulations, land use allocations, and regional development plans. Analysis shows that although this regional regulation generally aligns with the spatial planning principles established in Law No. 26 of 2007 on Spatial Planning, some minor inconsistencies require adjustments. For example, the regional regulation's zoning provisions and land use allocations must be adjusted to ensure consistency with national guidelines. Furthermore, the development plans outlined in the regional regulation have not fully integrated more comprehensive sustainability principles. Thus, adjustments are necessary to support sustainable development.

Law No. 26 of 2007 serves as the national legal framework in spatial planning and provides principles that regional regulations must follow. The RTRW Regional Regulation of Gunung Sitoli City largely follows these principles. However, there are shortcomings in integrating community participation principles and law enforcement that must be addressed. The comparison between the provisions in the regional regulation and the provisions in the law shows several technical differences that must be addressed to ensure complete alignment with the law.

Guidelines for harmonizing regional regulations with national policies can be found in the Harmonization Policy and Procedure Document of the North Sumatra Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights. Analysis shows that the harmonization process is done using the established procedures. However, there are weaknesses in the supervision and guidance provided to the Gunung Sitoli City Government. To improve the effectiveness of harmonization, a more active role from the Regional Office is needed in reviewing the substance of regional regulations and providing the necessary technical support.

The Regional Regulation Evaluation Document assesses the results of harmonizing and implementing the RTRW Regional Regulation. According to the evaluation, the regional regulation is generally in line with higher laws, but there are challenges in its implementation on the ground. Some implementation issues must be addressed to ensure that national policies are effectively applied. Recommendations from the evaluation include revising the regional regulation to address implementation issues and adjusting policies to tackle the identified challenges. Overall, the triangulation of these documents indicates that although Regional Regulation No. 12 of 2012 has complied with many national provisions, there is a need for adjustments in several aspects to enhance the alignment and effectiveness of spatial planning policies in Gunung Sitoli City. Improvements in the harmonization process and field implementation will strengthen the consistency between local and national policies and enhance the outcomes of policy implementation.

4.2. Discussion

a. Theoretical Framework

According to Kelsen, in the Pure Theory of Law, translated by Max Knight in 1967, the law is a hierarchical system in which lower norms derive legitimacy from higher norms until they reach the basic norm (Grundnorm). This concept is relevant to explain how regional regulations must be adjusted to national laws to prevent legal conflicts in the context of harmonizing regional regulations with higher laws. According to LM Gandhi in Endrik Safudin (2021:13), harmonization in law includes the adjustment of laws, government decisions, judicial decisions, legal systems, and legal principles to enhance legal clarity, certainty, justice, and proportionality without obscuring or sacrificing legal pluralism if necessary—harmonization of regional regulation drafts. According to Wahyuni and Ambari (Setyaningrum et al., 2019), it is defined as an effort to harmonize, adjust, stabilize, and consolidate the ideas of a regional regulation draft with legislation, whether higher, equal, or lower, as well as other matters besides legislation. So that they are arranged in an orderly manner and do not contradict or overlap. According to Benny, harmonizing regulations aims to avoid overlaps between central and regional regulations, including spatial planning. Harmonization is carried out

through inter-agency coordination to ensure regulatory alignment. The Regional Regulation of Gunungsitoli City Number 12 of 2012 on the Regional Spatial Plan (RTRW) states that harmonizing regional and national regulations is one of the important steps towards aligning local policies with higher legal frameworks. According to Article 2 of Regional Regulation Number 12 of 2012, one of the objectives of the Spatial Planning of Gunungsitoli City is to ensure the sustainable use of regional space by national policies as regulated in Law Number 26 of 2007 concerning Spatial Planning. Thus, it can be concluded that legal harmonization is an effort to align regional and higher regulations at the national and international levels. Kelsen's concept of the hierarchy of norms emphasizes that regional regulations must obtain validity from higher regulations, thereby avoiding legal conflicts and ensuring legal certainty. This harmonization also aims to prevent regulatory overlaps through inter-agency coordination, as explained by Benny (Kurniawan, 2023), and to ensure that local policies, such as the RTRW of Gunungsitoli City, are in line with national policies, as regulated in Law Number 26 of 2007 on Spatial Planning. Harmonizing regulations is crucial for creating a transparent, accountable, effective, and efficient government. With the alignment between local and national policies, the government can ensure that the decision-making process and policy implementation run according to the principles of good governance to provide the best benefits for the community. To help the government carry out its primary task, which is to serve the citizens, Richo Andi Wibowo said that good governance is a good idea. According to Agus Dwiyanto, good governance is also a movement driven by the interests of various donors and international financial institutions to enhance the intuition in third-world countries about implementing various activities funded by these institutions. According to Hasibuan (Prayitno et al., 2016), applying sound governance principles at the regional level is important to ensure that spatial planning is participatory and transparent. This principle aligns with George R. Terry's view of defining government administration as a process aimed at achieving results through activities managed effectively and efficiently by authorized authorities. Nasution emphasizes the importance of administrative law in spatial planning management, which functions to regulate the authority and responsibility of the government in implementing spatial policies. Therefore, to achieve optimal spatial planning, administration based on the principles of good governance is needed, where transparency, participation, effectiveness, and efficiency become the main pillars of its implementation.

According to Yunus Wahid (Saputra, 2022), as a form of public relations, spatial planning functions as a legal tool to ensure and harmonize various land-use interests, including economic, social, cultural, and ecological interests. According to Suhardjo, spatial planning is not limited to physical planning but also involves aspects of regional development to balance economic development and environmental preservation. In this case, the basic concept used in spatial planning laws is in line with that stated in the fourth paragraph of the preamble of the 1945 Constitution, where Juniarso Ridwan explains that the goals of spatial planning include the protection of the entire Indonesian nation, the improvement of general welfare, the intellectual advancement of the nation, and participation in maintaining world order. According to Ridwan (Setiawan & Firdaus, 2022), implementing wise spatial planning design is key to spatial planning execution so as not to damage the environment. In other words, the developmental activities resulting from spatial planning generally have the nuance of utilizing natural resources without harming the environment.

Lawrence M. Friedman divides the legal system into three interrelated components to support the implementation of spatial planning law: legal structure, legal substance, and legal culture. The legal structure includes institutions such as courts and police that shape and enforce the law, while the legal substance encompasses societal norms and customs. On the other hand, legal culture reflects society's attitudes and values towards the law, which affects how the law is applied and respected. These three components must work together for the legal system, including spatial planning, to function well. Constitutional law provides the legal basis for the division of authority in spatial planning between the central and regional levels, which must be applied consistently. Thus, effective spatial planning depends on planning, regional development, and the proper application of law through the synergy between existing structures, substance, and legal culture.

b. Data Collection Techniques

Data collection techniques can be carried out in four ways: observation, documentation, interviews, and audiovisual. In this research, data was collected through the study and examination of related official documents, which included:

1. Law Number 12 of 2012 concerning the Regional Spatial Planning (RTRW) of Gunung Sitoli City. This document is the main object of the research because it reflects local policies harmonized with national policies.
2. Legislative Regulations Regarding Spatial Planning, national regulatory documents such as the Law on Spatial Planning and other policies in the field of spatial planning are used as references to measure the conformity and consistency of the RTRW Regional Regulation with higher regulations.
3. The Harmonization Policy and Procedure Document, which explains the procedures, mechanisms, and harmonization strategies implemented by the Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights of North Sumatra, was also analyzed to provide insights into the steps taken in the harmonization process.

c. Data Analysis Techniques

Data is analyzed using thematic analysis methods. According to Namirah et al. (Fahmi, 2022), thematic analysis is a process by which researchers discover, analyze, and report data in interpreted themes or patterns. The researcher identifies the main themes related to the roles, constraints, and effectiveness of harmonization based on the documents that have been reviewed. This research focuses on the harmonization process of the North Sumatra Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights, as well as the conformity of the RTRW Regional Regulation with higher regulations. The steps of this thematic analysis include:

1. Data Encoding
Important information in the document is identified and coded based on emerging themes, such as coordination, legal substance adjustments, technical constraints, and policy effectiveness.
2. Identify the Theme
Key themes that emerged from the coding process were analyzed to see the role of the Regional Office in harmonization, the challenges faced, and the impact of harmonization on the implementation of RTRW policies.
3. Evaluation of Effectiveness
Thematic results are used to assess the effectiveness of the harmonization that has been carried out based on the alignment between the RTRW regional regulation and national regulations.

d. Validity and Reliability of Data

To ensure the validity and reliability of the data, this research uses document triangulation. Technique triangulation means collecting data from various sources, according to Sugiyono in Andarusni Alfansyur's journal (Yeheschiel B. Marewa, 2020). Researchers simultaneously use documentation, in-depth interviews, and passive observation for the same data sources. Data from various types of documents (regional regulations, national regulations, and policy documents) are compared to check the consistency of information and avoid bias. By using official documents from reliable sources, the research results can be guaranteed for their reliability. This process ensures that the findings produced are consistent and relevant to the policy context so that the analysis results can be used as a valid reference in evaluating the functions of the North Sumatra Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights in harmonizing RTRW Regional Regulations.

IV. Conclusion

This study emphasizes the importance of the North Sumatra Regional Office of the Ministry of Law and Human Rights in perfecting the Regional Regulation of Gunung Sitoli City Number 12 of 2012 concerning the Regional Spatial Plan (RTRW). The Regional Office ensures that the RTRW Regional Regulation complies with national regulations and applicable legal principles. Harmonization successfully improves the alignment of local policies with national policies, but several obstacles still require more attention, such as resource limitations and differences in technical interpretation. This research shows that although the harmonization process has been effective, some minor adjustments are needed to enhance the integration and implementation of sustainable spatial planning policies in the City of Gunung Sitoli.

References

- Bangun, H. A. W. (2024). Peran Bagian Hukum Sekretariat Daerah Dalam Pembentukan Produk Hukum Daerah Pada Pemerintah Kota Binjai. Fakultas Hukum, Universitas Islam Sumatera Utara. <http://repository.uisu.ac.id/handle/123456789/3425>
- Drawi, I. K., Arba, A., & Putro, W. D. (2024). Eksistensi Hak Ulayat Masyarakat Hukum Adat Atas Hutan Setelah Terbentuknya Peraturan Daerah Kabupaten Lombok Utara Nomor 6 Tahun 2020 Tentang Pengakuan Dan Perlindungan Masyarakat Hukum Adat. *Jatiswara*39(2), 209–228. <https://jatiswara.unram.ac.id/index.php/js/article/view/724>.
- Enggartias, A. (2021). Pelaksanaan Fungsi Legislasi Dprd Kabupaten Bengkalis Tahun 2016- 2020 Dalam Pembuatan Peraturan Daerah Menurut Fiqih Siyash. Universitas Islam Negeri Sultan Syarif Kasim Riau. <http://repository.uin-suska.ac.id/id/eprint/55608>
- Fahmi, S. (2022). Peran Pemerintah Daerah Dalam Penegakan Hukum Terhadap Usaha Hiburan Malam Musik Hidup Berdasarkan Peraturan Daerah Nomor 2 Tahun 2003 Tentang Perizinan Penyelenggaraan Hiburan Dikota Cilegon. Universitas Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa. <http://eprints.untirta.ac.id/id/eprint/18613>
- Febrianti, P., & Nurlaila, N. (2024). Penerapan Sistem Informasi Manajemen Kepegawaian (Simpeg) Di Kementerian Hukum Dan Ham Sumatera Utara. *Jurnal Riset Akuntansi*, 2(2), 10–21.
- Guseva, Y. (2022). When The Means Undermine The End: The Leviathan Of Securities Law And Enforcement In Digital-Asset Markets. *Stan. J. Blockchain L. & Pol'y*, 5, 1.
- Hariyanto, E. (2022). Harmonisasi Peraturan Daerah Berdasarkan Asas Lex Superior Derogate Legi Inferiori Untuk Mencapai Kepastian Hukum Dalam Suatu Peraturan Daerah. *Ensiklopedia Education Review*, 4(2), 136–142. <https://doi.org/10.33559/eer.v4i2.1722>
- Helmi, H. (2021). Penataan Peraturan Daerah Dengan Metode Omnibus Law: Urgensi Dan Mekanisme. *Undang: Jurnal Hukum*, 4(2), 441–472. <https://doi.org/10.22437/Ujh.4.2.441-472>
- Kariem, M. Q., & Ishmatuddin, N. (2021). Analisis Faktor-Faktor Penentu Tata Kelola Pemerintahan Di Pemerintah Kota Surabaya Periode Kepemimpinan Tri Risma Harini Tahun 2015-2020. *Kemudi: Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan*, 5(02), 239–248.
- Khairi, R. (2024). Peran Lembaga Bantuan Hukum Pilar Advokasi Sumatera Utara Dalam Pendampingan Hukum Terhadap Tahanan Kasus Narkotika Di Lembaga Pemasyarakatan Kelas Ii A Rantauprapat. Universitas Labuhanbatu.
- Kurniawan, A. P. (2023). Analisis Keberhasilan Program Kampung Keluarga Berencana (KB) Dan Implikasi Terhadap Penurunan Kelahiran Di Kelurahan Pucangawit Kecamatan Jebres Kota Surakarta. Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta.
- Mayang, F. A. (2024). Analisis Penerapan Sistem Pengendalian Intern Pada Pengelolaan Barang Milik Negara Di Kantor Wilayah Kementerian Hukum Dan Ham Provinsi Sumatera Utara. *Jurnal Pengabdian Kepada Masyarakat Nusantara*, 5(1), 1357–1362. <https://doi.org/10.55338/jpkmn.v5i1.2980>
- Mulyana, I. (2018). Analisis Implementasi Program Bantuan Tentang Perbaikan Rumah Tidak Layak Huni Di Kecamatan Tanjungsari Kabupaten Sumedang. *Jrpa-Journal of Regional Public Administration*, 3(1), 29–34.
- Murjani, M., & Sapparuddin, M. (2021). Kebijakan Hukum Pemerintah Daerah Dalam Penetapan Rencana Tata Ruang Wilayah Dampak Pembangunan Ibu Kota Negara.
- Nugroho, B. E., & Pradana, G. W. (2021). Peran Pemerintah Dalam Meningkatkan Kualitas Hidup Masyarakat Melalui Progam Rehabilitasi Sosial Rumah Tidak Layak Huni Kota Surabaya. *Publika*, 9(3), 155–166. <https://doi.org/10.26740/publika.v9n3.p155-166>

- Panagopoulos, A., & Tzionas, I. (2023). The Use Of Sustainable Financial Instruments About The Social Impact Investment: Esg Policies, Capital Markets' Approach And Investors' Protection: An Innovative Perspective For A Global Surveillance Authority. *International Journal Of Business Administration*. <https://doi.org/10.5430/ijba.v14n1p87>
- Prasetyanti, R. (2021). Penataan Permukiman Kumuh Terintegrasi Di Kota Semarang. *The Indonesian Journal Of Public Administration (Ijpa)*, 7(1), 55–75. <https://doi.org/10.52447/ijpa.v7i1.4650>
- Prayitno, B., Kusumawanto, A., Kristiadi, D., & Suryanto, S. (2016). Skema Inovatif Pemenuhan Kesejahteraan Atas Papan. *Jurnal Kawistara*, 6(1), 47–61. <https://doi.org/10.22146/kawistara.15487>
- Priadi, A., Sobri, M., Setyoko, P. I., & Putra, R. (2024). Model Collaborative Governance Dalam Penyediaan Perumahan (Studi Pada Program Rehabilitasi Sosial Rumah Tak Layak Huni Di Kota Prabumulih Provinsi Sumatera Selatan). *Ganaya: Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Dan Humaniora*, 7(1), 152–164.
- Putra, M. A. (2019). Pengaruh Kepemimpinan Terhadap Partisipasi Masyarakat Dalam Program Rehabilitasi Sosial Rumah Tidak Layak Huni (Rs-Rtlh)(Desa Mumbang Jaya Kecamatan Jabung Kabupaten Lampung Timur). <http://digilib.unila.ac.id/id/eprint/55120>
- Rini, D. S. (2020). Efektivitas Implementasi Program Rehabilitasi Rumah Tidak Layak Huni (Rtlh) Di Kecamatan Purbalingga, Kabupaten Purbalingga. Universitas Jenderal Soedirman. <http://repository.unsoed.ac.id/id/eprint/13420>
- Saad, A. I., & Strauss, D. (2020). A New" Reasonable Investor" And Changing Frontiers Of Materiality: Increasing Investor Reliance On Esg Disclosures And Implications For Securities Litigation. *Berkeley Bus. Lj*, 17, 391.
- Saputra, J. (2022). Upaya Pemerintah Mengurangi Kemiskinan Dengan Program Bedah Rumah Di Kota Jambi. *Iltizam Journal Of Shariah Economics Research*, 6(2), 241–249. <https://doi.org/10.30631/iltizam.v6i2.1524>
- Setiawan, H., & Firdaus, V. (2022). Tinjauan Yuridis Pasal 44 Huruf B Peraturan Daerah Kota Mojokerto Nomor 3 Tahun 2013: Tentang Penyelenggaraan Ketertiban Umum. *Actual*, 12(1), 10–17.
- Setyaningrum, M. H., Sriyana, S., & Purwanggono, B. (2019). Analisa Faktor Yang Berpengaruh Terhadap Keberhasilan Penyediaan Rumah Khusus. *Rekayasa*, 12(2), 126–134. <https://doi.org/10.21107/rekayasa.v12i2.5854>
- Simamora, J., & Manullang, R. S. (2024). Peraturan Daerah Kota Gunung Sitoli Nomor 12 Tahun 2012 Tentang Rencana Tata Ruang Wilayah (RTRW) Kota Gunung Sitoli Dan Pelaksanaan Peran Kantor Wilayah Kementerian Hukum Dan Ham Sumatera Utara. *Jurnal Rectum: Tinjauan Yuridis Penanganan Tindak Pidana*, 6(2).
- Sukayana, K., Telagawathi, N. L. W. S., & Rahmawati, P. I. (2023). Pengaruh Kepemimpinan, Pengawasan, Dan Motivasi Penerima Manfaat Terhadap Efektivitas Program Bantuan Rumah Tidak Layak Huni Kabupaten Buleleng. *Publik: Jurnal Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia, Administrasi Dan Pelayanan Publik*, 10(3), 911–922. <https://doi.org/10.37606/publik.v10i3.750>
- Sumiati, S., Harahap, R. H., & Isnaini, I. (2021). Penyelenggaraan Administrasi Di Bagian Umum Pemerintahan Sekretariat DPRD Provinsi Sumatera Utara. *Strukturasi: Jurnal Ilmiah Magister Administrasi Publik*, 3(1), 118–133. <https://doi.org/10.31289/strukturasi.v3i1.728>
- Tambunan, F. A. E. (2024). Peranan Pemerintah Kota Binjai Dalam Sosialisasi Produk Hukum Daerah Yang Bersifat Pengaturan Di Kota Binjai (Studi Di Pemerintah Kota Binjai). *Fakultas Hukum, Universitas Islam Sumatera Utara*. <http://repository.uisu.ac.id/handle/123456789/3422>
- Tambunan, H. K. R. (2021). Implementasi Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 60 Tahun 2008 Tentang Sistem Pengendalian Intern Pemerintah Dalam Meningkatkan Kualitas Laporan Keuangan Pada Kantor Wilayah Kementerian Hukum Dan HAM Sumatera Utara. *Universitas Medan Area*. <https://repositori.uma.ac.id/handle/123456789/19791>
- Thea, A., & Sh, N. S. E. (2024). Tinjauan Yuridis Terhadap Peraturan Daerah Kabupaten Klaten No 10 Tahun 2021 Tentang Rencana Tata Ruang Wilayah (Rtrw)(Studi Kasus Peralihan Fungsi Lahan Kab. Klaten). *Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta*. <http://eprints.ums.ac.id/id/eprint/125616>
- Welfin, D. (2023). Perlindungan Hukum Bagi Investor Indonesia Pada Perusahaan Joint Venture Dalam Perusahaan Penanam Modal Asing. *Unes Law Review*, 6(2), 7178–7184. <https://doi.org/10.31933/unesrev.v6i2.1590>
- Wu, D., & Memon, H. (2022). Public Pressure, Environmental Policy Uncertainty, And Enterprises' Environmental Information Disclosure. *Sustainability*, 14(12), 6948. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su14126948>
- Yasser, M. (2021). Partisipasi Masyarakat Dalam Pembentukan Peraturan Daerah Provinsi Sumatera Utara Nomor 5 Tahun 2019 Tentang Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah Daerah Provinsi Sumatera Utara Tahun 2019-2023 Ditinjau Dalam Fiqh Siyasah (Studi Di DPRD Provinsi Sumatera Ut. *Fakultas Ekonomi Dan Bisnis Islam Uinsu Medan*. <http://repository.uinsu.ac.id/id/eprint/9078>
- Yeheschiel B. Marewa, M. T. (2020). Penerapan Prinsip Good Governance Dalam Penyelenggaraan Pemerintahan Di Daerah Kabupaten Toraja Utara. *Paulus Law Journal*, 1(1), 40–47. <https://doi.org/10.51342/plj.v1i1.46>